

Lesson 4

Question for the Lesson/What you need to know in this lesson:

What were the reforms carried under the Self-strengthening Movement between 1861-1894?

How successful were the reforms? What were the reasons for the success/failures of the reforms?

IB Questions

1. Why did China fail to modernize effectively between 1861 and 1894? (M05, Q8)
 2. Evaluate the successes and failures of the Self-strengthening movement in China (1861-1894). (M15)
 3. Analyse China's attempt to modernize and overcome its weaknesses in the period 1862 to 1894. (N02, Q4)
-

1. Overview: Tung-Chih (Tongzhi Restoration)/Self-strengthening Movement

The peace settlement with Britain and France in 1860 and the suppression of the Taiping Revolution in 1860 eliminated two deadly threats to the dynasty; one external and one internal

In the period that followed, the Qing court was engaged in the process called "Tung-chih Restoration" – efforts at restoring the traditional order through reaffirmation of the old morality and application of knowledge to practical affairs – **"Chinese learning is for the essence and western learning is for utility"**

Hsu: The Tung-chin Restoration stood at a lower level of revival in Chinese history. While it did stem the decline of the dynasty for a while, it failed to regenerate the dynasty to a degree sufficient to allow survival with honour in the modern world. Its imitation of Western armament, technology, and diplomacy was a superficial gesture towards modernization; the finer aspects of Western civilization – political institutions, social theories, philosophy, fine arts and music – went totally untouched.

But it signalled a brave and reasonably successful effort at reviving the old order and **to initiate the beginning of a new.**

2. Self-Strengthening Movement (1861-1895)

Efforts to create a modern navy and introduction of military modernization through the adoption of foreign ships and guns, organization of supporting industries and opening of new training schools by the provincial leaders Tseng Kuo-fan, Tso Tsung-t'ang and Li Hung-chang – beginning of the Self-Strengthening Movement, which lasted through three and a half decades to 1895.

First-Period (1861-1872)

A. Diplomatic Reforms

Achievements	Limitations/Failures
<p>The Tsungli Yamen (A foreign office), 1861</p> <p>The Qing court had not previously established a foreign office, because China never accorded recognition to another state on an equal, diplomatic, but only on a tributary or trading basis.</p> <p>After the Conventions of Peking in 1860 reaffirmed Western diplomatic residence in the Chinese capital, there was genuine need for foreign office to centralize the direction of foreign affairs.</p> <p>It was intended to be a temporary office under the charge of Prince Kung (Prince Gong).</p> <p>In theory, it concerned itself only with the execution of foreign policy, not the making of it, since the ultimate power of decision rested with the emperor and his chief adviser, the Grand Council. In practice, however, the recommendations of the Tsungli Yamen were usually approved by the throne, Prince Kung and Wen-hsiang being both concurrently grand councillors.</p> <p>It engaged not only in foreign affairs but also in a number of modernization projects. Its promotion of modern schools, Western science, industry and communication exposed it to frequent attacks by die-hard conservatives, while foreigners often criticized it for not progressing fast enough.</p> <p>Where it failed as an effective foreign office, the Tsungli Yamen succeeded reasonably well as a promoter of modernization. It was China's first major institutional innovation in response to the Western impact.</p>	<p>It played an active role in the 1860s, but its influence waned after 1869-70 with the waning of influence of Prince Kung himself</p> <p>Success of Li-Hung-chang after he undertook the Tientsin commissionership in 1870 and he practically pre-empted the functions of the Tsungli Yamen.</p> <p>It was Li who settled the case of the Tientsin Massacre in 1870, recommended the establishment of an official relationship with Japan in 1871, and settled the Margary murder incident in 1875-76, conducted negotiations with the French over the Annamese question in 1884, and took charge of the opening of Korea in the early 1880s and negotiations with Japan after the war of 1894-1895.</p> <p>Li's office at Tientsin became virtually China's foreign office for the quarter of century following 1870.</p>

<p>The Maritime Customs Service</p> <p>Duty of collecting revenue at various ports</p> <p>Robert Hart was appointed as Inspector General of Chinese Maritime Customs. Under Hart, Chinese customs was transformed from an antiquated set-up, anarchical and prone to corruption, into a well-regulated modern organisation, and contributed to Chinese economy. In 5 years, up to mid-1965, it delivered to Beijing duties of well over 32 million taels. The indemnities to Britain and France were paid out of the Customs revenue. (Jung Chang)</p> <p>Made huge sums of money which was made available to the government, especially in the context where its income from land and poll tax was dropping sharply due to the growing power of the provincial governments</p> <p>The revenue collected this played a major role in supporting the self-strengthening projects</p>	
<p>Introduction of International Law</p> <p>Prior to the Opium War, there was no complete text of the law of nations in Chinese</p> <p>Ignorance of international law led early Chinese negotiators into many blunders: they conceded easily on significant issues such as tariff autonomy, extraterritoriality, and the most-favoured nation treatment while struggling with issues like diplomatic residence and audience with the kowtow.</p> <p>Prince Kung in his eagerness to learn about the Western diplomacy, was secretly anxious to know international law. A translated version of the international law was made available.</p> <p>Wielding this new knowledge in combination with other measures of diplomatic modernization, China managed to maintain peaceful relations with the foreign powers throughout the decade of the 1860s, thus furnishing the country with a much needed respite to begin the Self-Strengthening programs.</p>	<p>But Increased level of Foreign Encroachment on China in the latter half of the 19th century – see later part of the notes</p>

B. Introduction of T'ung-Wen Kuan (Tongwan Guan)

Achievements	Limitations/Failures
<p>Established in Peking in 1862 at the suggestion of Prince Kung - known to foreigners as the Interpreters College or the College of Foreign Languages</p> <p>Was originally intended as a school for the joint instruction of Western and Chinese languages</p> <p>It was created in response to the French and British Tientsin Treaty clauses specifying the English and French texts as the sole authentic version of the treatise and China thus needed to train able language experts.</p> <p>Felt that there was a need for China to adopt Western international law and diplomatic practices</p> <p>Since no Chinese were qualified to instruct foreign languages, an English and French missionary as well as a Russian interpreter were invited to teach their respective languages</p> <p>By 1866 astronomy and mathematics were introduced to the curriculum and after 1869 a variety of subjects like Physics and International Law too were added – against the opposition of the arch-conservatives</p> <p>the Tung-Wen Kuan marked the beginning of Western education in China</p> <p>Since many of the foreign professors also engaged in translation with the help of their Chinese students, the school simultaneously functioned as a prototype research institute for dissemination of foreign knowledge.</p> <p>In 1873 a small printing office was set up as a primitive sort of “university” press from which 17 major publications were issued in the fields of international law, political economy, chemistry, physics and natural philosophy.</p> <p>Similar schools of foreign languages</p>	<p>The quality of students, however, was rather low, since few good Manchu or Chinese families would send their sons for such education</p> <p>Thus a considerable portion of the student body consisted of middle-aged mediocrities enrolled for pension.</p>

and Western studies were established at Shanghai in 1863, at Canon in 1864, and at Foochow in 1866.

The Tung-wen Kuan was absorbed into the Imperial University in 1902.

Also stressed the importance of adoption of Western firearms, machines, scientific knowledge and the training of technical and diplomatic personnel through the establishment of translation bureaus, new schools, and the dispatch of students abroad. Diplomatic innovations were introduced to insure good relations with western powers so that China could find out about their shipbuilding and armament secrets. – to learn the superior techniques of the barbarians to control the barbarians

But there was no recognition of the need for anything else from the West

C. Military Modernization

Reason for Military Modernisation

China's defeat in 1860 shocked the intelligentsia and officialdom into a greater awakening and the great difference between the old world that China had known in its past and the new world that had been thrust upon it, urged China to adopt Western ships and guns, and construct dockyards and arsenals in the trading ports – **learn the superior techniques of the barbarians to control the barbarians**

The traditional military were a hereditary caste and became weak over time. The Manchu bannerman, who constituted the backbone of the Manchu military power at the beginning of the dynasty, **degenerated to a point where they could no longer could fight** due to life of gambling, theatre-going and corruption and long period of peace. **Corruption and incompetency was also rampant in the Chinese Green Standard army.**

The Chinese Provincial leaders **experienced first-hand the superiority of Western guns during the Taiping Rebellion**

Achievements	Limitations/Failures
<p>Modern Arsenals</p> <p>A. Kiangnan Arsenal was established at Shanghai in 1865</p> <p>The arsenal manufactured guns and canons and also constructed ships. Its first ship was successfully completed in 1868, arsenal turned out a total of 5 ships, the last in 1872 with 400 horsepower and carrying 26 guns</p> <p>The arsenal also maintained a translation bureau which completed 98 titles of western works in less than a year, involving works on technology, military affairs and natural science</p>	<p>Modern Arsenals</p> <p>A. There was over-reliance on foreigners for operation and materials</p> <p>Blind faith in the ability of foreigners regardless of their training and experience – for instance, the Nanking Arsenal in 1867 was put under the direction of an Englishman, Halliday Macartney, a medical doctor</p> <p>The materials for construction of ships were all imported</p> <p>Because of poor leadership and bureaucratic corruption, the ships and guns</p>

<p>B. Foochow Dockyard in 1866 – Tso Tsung-t'ang was responsible for it – two Frenchmen as engineers and supervisor – turned out a total of 40 ships</p> <p>Its naval school graduated a number of able officers</p> <p>Foochow Dockyard was the second most important achievement of the SSM</p> <p>C. Nanking Arsenal in 1867, a naval and military academy – Li Hung-chang</p> <p>D. Sending of 30 students and apprentices from the Foochow Dockyard to Britain and France - 1876</p>	<p>were nowhere comparable in quality to their Western counterparts.</p> <p>B. These military industries formed the power bases of the provincial leaders sponsoring them</p> <p>Li Hung-chang built the Nanking Arsenal and Tso Tsung-tang constructed the Foochow Dockyard – there was little concerted effort or coordination between the various regional groups</p> <p>For instance, during the French war of 1884 the Peiyang and Nanyang fleets refused to go to the rescue of the Fukien fleet under enemy attack – sense of regionalism and eagerness for self-preservation</p> <p>Similarly, during the Sino-Japanese War in 1894, only Li Hung-chang's Peiyang fleet fought the Japanese, whereas the Nanyang fleet and the other two provincial squadrons at Canton and Foochow remained neutral for self-preservation. Hence, despite boasting of 65 ships compared with Japan's 32, China lost the battle as not all of China's fleet were mobilized and thus it was just Li's regional force fighting against the might of the entire Japanese empire.</p> <p>So despite the fact that by 1882 China had 50 steamships and were divided into 4 fleets, there was no unified command as they were controlled by different provincial leaders</p> <p>C. Corruption/Lack of Funds</p> <p>In late 1880s, naval funds were diverted to the building of Empress Dowager Cixi's Summer Palace.</p> <p>Li Hung-chang's Peiyang command was corrupted and had irregularities. Many of the army and navy officers embezzled the funds for modernization of military.</p> <p>As a result, the big ten-inch guns on the two iron-clads ships used during the Sino-Japanese War, were allocated only 3 shells each and the many smaller guns were assigned wrong size shot. The funds for the ammunition lined the pockets of the officer in charge of supply. Hence, the Peiyang was a fleet good only for cruising the</p>
--	---

	harbors and not for fighting a modern war such as that against the Japanese, leading to the defeat of China in the war.
Modern Military Training A. Anhui Army formed by Li Hung-chang Was armed with modern weapons and trained with modern drills by German advisers B. The Tianjin Academy was formed to train officers C. Officers sent by Li Hung-chang to study in Germany – 1872	A. Gave rise to issue of provincial armies – no unified command B. Unlike the traditional system, where the officers were constantly rotated, a major change was now the officers remained with their units and thus it gave the officers the opportunity to choose people they wanted which led to nepotism and corruption C. The Chinese imperial army was a mixture of modernized and traditional units and the modernized units were in the minority. It also had 14 different types of modern and old weapons as the old model were not phased out as new weapons became available and this led to a logistical nightmare. 40% of the soldiers did not even have modern weapons D. Resistance from the traditional troops – it was difficult to dislodge them and were ill-trained, ill-equipped, and corrupted

Overall Assessment for the failure of Modernization of Military

Strong Prevailing Traditional Mindset

Qing officials were unwilling to support Western training and organization. Confucian morality disdained the use of military and made them belief that morality would ensure. Thus the scholar-officials were inadequate for the task of modernizing the military.

Also, it was assumed that it was technology that explained Western training and organization and thus there was no significant effort to train the soldiers and sailors on modern lines. Instead their training stressed ethical issues rather than specific technical skills.

Even Li Hung-chang's who was preoccupied with shipyards and guns, neglected the importance of learning the Western political systems and culture, which thus limited the scope of the SSM. **His attitude stemmed partially from his belief that China surpassed the West in everything except weaponry** and partially from the fact that he was in charge of military training and coastal defence. **He saw China's immediate need for military**

strength but not the larger and more distant requirement for political and social reform

Second-Period (1872-1885)

As the Self-strengthening Movement progressed, **there was increasing recognition that wealth was the basis of power – one had to be rich in order to be strong**

Modern defence cost far more than traditional cost and it **had to be supported by better communications systems, industries and enterprises.**

Hence in the second period while defence industries remained a chief occupation, **greater attention was directed to the development of profit-oriented enterprises such as shipping, railways, mining, and the telegraph.**

In addition to the government-sponsored military industries, there **now appeared another type of enterprise – government supervised merchant undertakings** – Capital for these undertakings came from private sources, profit and loss are entirely the responsibility of the merchants, but the merchants were barred from the management, which were in the hands of government-appointed officials or private individuals

Achievements	Limitations/Failures
<p>Inauguration of the China's Merchants' Steam Navigation Company as government supervised merchant undertakings in 1872</p> <p>It was to be supported by railways to bring coal for the steamships</p> <p>Inauguration of a telegraph line between Taku and Tientsin – 1879</p> <p>Creation of a railway north of Tientsin - 1881</p>	<p>These government-supervised merchant enterprises were smacked of strong official overtones and the usual bureaucratic inefficiency, corruption and nepotism was prevalent.</p> <p>Being profit orientated, they discouraged private competition and tended to monopolize business through government favour or intervention.</p> <p>There was little effort to link various enterprises such as railways, coal and steamships enterprises as the development of modern communications was for the purpose of supporting the government, the military and its industries rather than to foster economic progress</p> <p>Railways were seen as affecting fengshui and also causing unemployment for traditional occupations like boatmen, carters and hence deeply resented</p>

Third-Period (1885-1895)

In this time period, while emphasis on the military and naval build-up continued, as witnessed by formal establishment of the Peiyang fleet in 1888, **the idea of enriching the nation through the light industry gained increasing importance**

Textile and cotton-weaving industries as well as coal, iron and steel industries gained momentum

Achievements	Limitations/Failures
Coal, steel, iron and textile industries gained momentum and were built near a treaty port and relied on foreign personnel and technology	Built modern industries primarily to serve the military and not intended to resolve the agricultural crisis and solve the rural unemployment issue
Li Hung-chang developed the first modern coal mining complex in Kaiping and a cotton mill in Shanghai	Many of these enterprises remained as government operations and private/merchant capital were forced out due to traditional official discrimination and resentment against merchants
Creation of a textile and cotton mill and an iron factory at Canton by Chang Chih-tung	The government needed merchant capital but it was unwilling to allow the merchants freedom of action and there were excessive red tape which prevented the industries from flourishing
	Yet the government expected to be repaid in full if the enterprise went bankrupt, which served to punish the private shareholders
	Private enterprises thus were weak and made up only small fraction of the total industrial effort and investment – a far cry from mobilizing private capital the way the Japanese did during the Meiji era
	Little effort to coordinate the industrial efforts among the provinces
	SSM barely scratched the surface of modernization, without achieving a breakthrough in industrialization

3. Self-Strengthening Movement and Foreign Imperialism

The last 3 decades of the 19th century in China were a period of accelerated foreign imperialistic encroachments.

Now not only the older aggressor nations such as Britain, France and Russia but also the latecomers, notably Germany and Japan executed their imperialistic designs.

Taking advantage of China's weakness, foreign powers nibbled away the frontier areas and tributary states

On the other hand, the Chinese were moving away from a position of superiority and disdain to one which was based on appeasement in their relationship with the West due to their military weakness

China could no longer rely on its traditional policy of playing one barbarian against the other due to the most favoured nation clause where it removed the main motive for the competitive pursuit of such privileges

By the close of the 19th century, China faced the ominous prospect of partition

The Sino-French War of 1884-1885

Vietnam recognized Chinese overlordship as part of the tributary system

The French wanted to expand into northern Vietnam after its discovery that the Red River in Tongking was a better route than Mekong to China's Yunnan province

China intervened upon Vietnam's request and France forced a war

Although Prince Kung and Li Hung-chang were opposed to the war before the completion of Chinese naval program and coastal defense, the young officials in the Qing court who feared that France would use Vietnam as a springboard for invasion of China

The French sent their navy to attack Foochow where they destroyed the dockyard and within an hour sank and damaged 11 Chinese warships

After 3 months of war, a formal agreement was concluded and in 1885 China accepted France occupation of Vietnam

Not only did China lost its tributary state, Annam (Vietnam), its Fukien Fleet and Foochow Dockyard, products of SSM, were also damaged

The loss of Vietnam and the damages experienced signalled the failure of the twenty-year old SSM. The limited diplomatic, military, and technological modernization had not strengthened the country to a point where it could resist foreign imperialism.

China's weakness prompted the British to emulate the French and detach Burma in 1885. A treaty was secured from China a year later, reducing Burma to a British protectorate.

With the loss of these tributary states in the South, the fate of the leading tributary in the northeast, Korea, hung in a delicate balance and this the Japanese were too astute not to notice.

Sino-Japanese War of 1894-1895

Korea was a tributary state of China but Japan sought to expand for strategic and economic reasons

War broke out in August 1894

Reason for China's defeat

(i) Lack of Unified Command

Only Li Hung-chang's Peiyang fleet fought the Japanese, whereas the Nanyang fleet and the other two provincial squadrons at Canton and Foochow remained neutral for self-preservation. Hence, despite boasting of 65 ships compared with Japan's 32, China lost the battle as not all of China's fleet were mobilized and thus it was **just Li's regional force fighting against the might of the entire Japanese empire.** Despite the fact that by 1882 China had 50 steamships and were divided into 4 fleets, **there was no unified command as they were controlled by different provincial leaders**

(iii) Inferior Military

Chinese soldiers lacked training and drilling.

There were no standardization of weapons; mixture of modern and ancient weapons

The ships that Li's Peiyang fleet possessed were large, old and slow moving at a speed of 15 or 16 knots whereas the Japanese ships were small, new and fast moving at a speed of 23 knots

(iii) Corruption

Li Hung-chang's Peiyang command was corrupted and had irregularities. Many of the army and navy officers embezzled the funds for modernization of military.

As a result, the big ten-inch guns on the two iron-clads ships used during the Sino-Japanese War, were allocated only 3 shells each and the many smaller guns were assigned wrong size shot. The funds for the ammunition lined the pockets of the officer in charge of supply. Hence, torpedoes were filled with scrap iron and munition bags with sand and fake cannonballs were painted to look like the real thing

The Treaty of Shimonoseki, 1895

Recognized Korean independence; Japan eventually annexed Korea in 1910

Cession of Taiwan, Pescadores and Liaotung Peninsula

Opening up of more Chinese ports

Japanese could open factories and this was quickly copied by the other powers

Impact of China's defeat in the Sino-Japanese War

(i) Scramble for Concessions

The defeat exposed the decadence of the Qing dynasty and motivated the foreign powers to engage in a scramble for concession.

For instance, the Russians took the Liaotung Peninsula, the Port Arthur and Dairen ports and built the Chinese Eastern Railway which went through Manchuria to Vladivostok

German seizure of Kiaochow and managed to get a 99 lease for it from the Qing court, along with a concession to build two railways in Shantung

The British leased Wei-haiwei for 25 years and Kowloon New Territories for 99 years while France leased Kwangchow Bay for 99 years and established a sphere of influence in Kwangtung-Kwangsi-Yunnan

Foreign imperialism cut the China melon into leased territories and spheres of interests, within which they constructed railways, opened mines, established factories and operated banks.

The cutting of the Chinese melon threatened the partition of the Qing dynasty (plunged China even deeper into a semi-colonial state)

The scramble of concessions finally tapered down in 1899 when America issued an Open Door policy due to the fear that China would collapse and the imperialist powers would go to war against each other's nationals

All powers were not to interfere in the vested interest of the others, no discrimination against each other's nationals, preserve Chinese tariffs

However, the Open Door Policy was a declaration of principles where no powers committed themselves and there was neither a will nor the power to enforce it militarily.

The partition of China tapered off more because of the fear that the imperialists countries would find themselves in rivalry and conflict with each other

(ii) New Political Movements in China

The defeat demonstrated beyond doubt the inability of the Qing court to cope with the challenges of the time. Superficial modernization of the Self-strengthening could not regenerate a rule deeply embedded in decadence. And the new crises of imperialism threatened the dismemberment of China.

There was a realization among the thinking Chinese that China's salvation lay in a radical reform or even a revolution. The progressives advocated institutional reorganization after the Meiji restoration. The radicals demanded a revolution to replace the Manchu dynasty with a Chinese republic.

These two currents constituted the main political movements in post-war China.

(iii) Growing Financial Strains on the Qing government

The first two payments to Japan already amounted to 100 million taels

The Qing court with an annual revenue of 89 million taels, was in no position to meet these obligations except by getting loans

It borrowed 400 million francs from a Franco-Russian banking Consortium and later 16 million pounds sterling, twice, from British-German Consortium

Such financial strain weakened the Chinese ability to modernise

Implication of outcome of the Sino-Japanese War

The Sino-Japanese War was a significant contest between the two after a generation of modernization and China faced humiliating defeat on land and at sea after more than 30 years of SSM

4. Overall Reasons for Limited success of Self-strengthening Movement

The list of achievements may present quite an impressive picture of endeavours. The SSM marked the beginning of industrialization and sowed the seeds of modern capitalism in China, with so many repercussions. The arsenals, dockyards, machine factories, schools and modern enterprises were mostly located in the treaty ports and cities along the coast or on the river and they contributed to the development of great metropolises such as Shanghai, Nanking, Tientsin, Foochow, Canton and Hankow. The new enterprises brought into being a new professional men such as engineers, managers, and entrepreneurs while those who studied abroad returned to become leaders in the army, navy schools and

diplomatic services. They contributed to the rise of new managerial and entrepreneurial class.

But they also really represented very superficial attempts at modernization. The basic weakness of SSM was exposed in the French war of 1884-85, when China after 20 years of preparation was unable to defend its tributary state Annam and again defeated in the war against Japan in 1894.

1.	Failure of change intellectual mindset/conservatism/ Limited vision	<p>The scope of activity was limited to firearms, ships, machines, and communications, mining and light industries. No attempts were made to assimilate Western institutions, philosophy, arts and culture – scholar-officials remained convinced of Chinese superiority</p> <p>This was due to the objective of wanting to learn techniques of the barbarians to control the barbarians – spirit and aim of SSM was already limited</p> <p>This mentality led to failure in understanding the sources of Western power which lied in their western institutions, philosophy and culture and etc.</p> <p>They did not dream of remaking China into a modern state, which resulted in handful of isolated modern enclaves scattered over an otherwise traditional country in which the old institution remained dominant</p> <p>Shackled by traditions, the Chinese officials were unable to shake off the age old disdain for merchants and continued to discourage private enterprise and competitions and failed to instill private initiative in the government industries or the government-supervised merchant undertakings</p>
1.	Lack of coordinated effort and support	<p>The court lacked political resolve despite the crisis</p> <p>Left the modernization effort to the provinces to also save cost - the provincial efforts were not directed, planned and coordinated by Beijing</p> <p>Too few self-strengtheners and some were just motivated by power and personal profit; they rivalled rather than cooperated (refer to neutrality of some fleets during China's war with France and Japan)</p>

4.	Lack of Capital	<p>The Qing government was never able to bring under control its overly complicated fiscal system – never had a proper accounting system or budget</p> <p>Were overly reliant on agrarian taxes which were fixed and much of the taxes went into the hands of the provincial leaders</p> <p>China lacked a banking system to provide capital needed for modernizing efforts</p> <p>Suffered from corruption – Eg. Li Hung-chang had large landholdings, silk stores and pawnshops throughout China</p>
5.	Impact of Foreign Imperialism	<p>Continued Encroachment on China</p> <p>Affected China's SSM</p> <p>But also proved that the SSM was piecemeal and ineffective (see above)</p>
6.	Role and Responsibility of Empress Dowager Cixi	

5. PROMINENT CHINESE LEADERS DURING THE SELF-STRENGTHENING MOVEMENT

1. To what extent do the careers of Zeng Guofan (Tseng Kuo-fan), Zuo Zongtang (Tso Tsung-t'ang) and Li Hongzhang (Li Hung-chang) demonstrate the weakness of the Qing (Ch'ing" government of China between 1864 and 1895? (M04, Q7)
2. With reference to the careers of Zeng Guofan (Tseng Kuo-fan), Zuo Zongtang (Tso Tsung-t'ang) and Li Hongzhang (Li Hung-chang), analyse the strength and weaknesses of the Qing (Ch'ing) government of China between 1864 and 1895. (N07, Q7)

Prince Kung's diplomatic modernization was paralleled by his efforts to create a modern navy and by those of the **provincial leaders –Tseng Kuo-fan, Tso Tsung-t'ang and Li Hung-chang – to introduce military modernization through the adoption of foreign ships and guns, organization of supporting industries, and opening of new training schools. Their endeavours marked the beginning of the SSM, which lasted through three and a half decades to 1895.**

From their association with foreign military in the Foreign Rifle Squadron and Ever-Victorious army during the Taiping campaigns, they had learnt firsthand the superiority of Western guns and ships.

Self-Strengtheners/ Modernizers (Provincial Leaders)	Achievements	Limitations/Failures
Zeng Guofan (Tseng Kuo-fan)	<p>Tseng was among those farsighted reformers who saw shipbuilding for survival. Tseng even tried building a ship in Anking in 1826. He was determined to unlock the secrets of shipbuilding and gun-making in order to break the Western monopoly of power</p> <p>Under Tseng's and Li's sponsorship, the Kiangnan Arsenal was established in 1865, with machines purchased from America. The arsenal not only manufactured guns and canon, but also constructed ships and maintained a translation bureau. The arsenal turned out a total of 5 ships, the last in 1872 with 400 horsepower and carrying 26 guns. The Arsenal shone as a major accomplishment in the</p>	<p>Died in 1872</p> <p>After Tseng's death, Li Hung-chang became the central spirit of Self-strengthening Movement</p>

	early phase of the Self-strengthening Movement – Tseng opened the way for modernization	
Zuo Zongtang (Tso Tsung-t'ang)	<p>(i) Military Modernization</p> <p>Tso had been a firm believer in the unity of knowledge and action. His interest in shipbuilding blossomed into the establishment of the famous Foochow Dockyard in 1866, with two Frenchmen.</p> <p>Attached to the dockyard was a naval school: one division specialized in French and shipbuilding while the other division in English and navigation</p> <p>Its naval school graduated a number of able officers. The Foochow Dockyard was the second most important achievement of the SSM.</p> <p>(ii) Enterprises</p> <p>Establishment of a textile factory in Kansu by Tso</p>	<p>The Foochow Dockyard was under the supervision of two Frenchmen, who had never built a ship before</p> <p>Sino-French War – 1884</p> <p>The French sent their navy to attack Foochow where they destroyed the dockyard and within an hour sank and damaged 11 Chinese warships</p> <p>China Fukien Fleet and Foochow Dockyard, products of SSM, were damaged</p> <p>The loss of Vietnam and the damages experienced signalled the failure of the twenty-year old SSM. The limited diplomatic, military, and technological modernization had not strengthened the country to a point where it could resist foreign imperialism.</p> <p>(ii)*For overall achievements and limitations of profit-making enterprises refer to notes above</p>
Li Hongzhang (Li Hung-chang)	Became a central spirit of SSM/sort of a coordinator of SSM throughout the country, although he was only a provincial authority	<p>However, he naively believed that possession of steamships and guns with explosive shells alone would suffice to stop foreign aggression.</p> <p>Li's occupation with ships and guns and his negligence of Western political system and culture very much limited the scope of the SSM. His attitude stemmed partially from his belief that China surpassed the west in everything except weaponry.</p>

	<p>(i) Military Modernization Li warned that if China did not catch up in shipbuilding and gun-making, Japan would imitate the West and take advantage of China and China would also fail to stop the advance of the West</p> <p>His long tenure as governor-general of Chihli and as High Commissioner of the Northern Ocean for practically the quarter of a century after 1870 enabled him to build a substantial military and industrial empire in North China.</p> <p>Establishment of the Tung-wen Kuan (foreign language school) at Shanghai; creation of a small gun factory at Soochow, Kiangnan Arsenal by Tseng and Li; Nanking Arsenal; Expansion of the Tientsin Machine Factory into 4 plants by Li; officers sent by Li to study in Germany; Request by Li to open coal and iron mines; Establishment of the Peiyang fleet under Li's control in 1888</p>	<p>Nanking Arsenal under the direction of an English medical doctor – blind faith in the ability of foreigners, regardless of their training and experience</p> <p>The ships that Li's Peiyang fleet possessed were large, old and slow moving at a speed of 15 or 16 knots whereas the Japanese ships were small, new and fast moving at a speed of 23 knots – poor showing of Li's army and navy at the Sino-Japanese War</p> <p>Corruption – was not noted for high morals and character. – misused 30 million taels of naval funds to construct the Summer Palace for the Dowager Cixi. Li chose his subordinates on the basis of their personal loyalty and willingness to work rather than for their ability and uprightness.</p> <p>Thus, Li's Peiyang command was corrupted and had irregularities. Many of the army and navy officers embezzled the funds for modernization of military. As a result, the big ten-inch guns on the two iron-clads ships used during the Sino-Japanese War, were allocated only 3 shells each and the many smaller guns were assigned wrong size shot. The funds for the ammunition lined the pockets of the officer in charge of supply. Hence, torpedoes were filled with scrap iron and munition bags with sand and fake cannonballs were painted to look like the real thing.</p> <p>There was little concerted effort or coordination</p>
--	---	--

	<p>(ii) Enterprises Li announced in 1876 that China's chronic weakness stems from poverty and thus in the second period of SSM, from 1872 onwards, there was greater attention in developing profit-oriented enterprises such as shipping, railways, mining and the telegraph.</p> <p>Inauguration of the China Merchants' Steam Navigation Company as a government-supervised merchant undertaking was supported by Li: Creation of the Bureau for the K'ai-ping Coal Mines at Tientsin by Li; Establishment of the Shanghai Cotton Mill by Li</p> <p>(iii) Diplomatic Affairs</p> <p>Success of Li-Hung-chang after he undertook the Tientsin commissionership in 1870 and he practically pre-empted the functions of the Tsungli Yamen.</p> <p>It was Li who settled the case of the Tientsin Massacre in 1870, recommended the establishment of an official relationship with Japan in 1871, and settled the Margary murder incident in 1875-</p>	<p>between the various regional groups. For instance, during the French war of 1884 the Peiyang and Nanyang fleets refused to go to the rescue of the Fukien fleet under enemy attack – sense of regionalism and eagerness for self-preservation.</p> <p>Similarly, during the Sino-Japanese War in 1894, only Li Hung-chang's Peiyang fleet fought the Japanese, whereas the Nanyang fleet and the other two provincial squadrons at Canton and Foochow remained neutral for self-preservation.</p> <p>(ii)*For overall achievements and limitations of profit-making enterprises refer to notes above</p> <p>Li reportedly left behind an estate of 40 million taels and his followers squeezed and milked the factories and enterprises under their charge</p> <p>Led to failure to centralize the direction of foreign affairs – aim of Tsungli Yamen</p>
--	--	---

	<p>76, conducted negotiations with the French over the Annamese question in 1884, and took charge of the opening of Korea in the early 1880s and negotiations with Japan after the war of 1894-1895.</p> <p>Li's office at Tientsin became virtually China's foreign office for the quarter of century following 1870.</p>	
--	---	--

* Link the achievements and limitations/failures of the 3 provincial leaders/reformers to the overall achievements and limitations/failures of SSM (above) as well as to the reasons for limited success of SSM.

6. Historiography: Assessment of Self-strengthening Movement

Historian	Argument
John Fairbank	First great age of Qing Modernization
Immanuel Hsu	<p>The Tung-chin Restoration stood at a lower level of revival in Chinese history. While it did stem the decline of the dynasty for a while, it failed to regenerate the dynasty to a degree sufficient to allow survival with honour in the modern world. Its imitation of Western armament, technology, and diplomacy was a superficial gesture towards modernization; the finer aspects of Western civilization – political institutions, social theories, philosophy, fine arts and music – went totally untouched.</p> <p>But it signalled a brave and reasonably successful effort at reviving the old order and to initiate the beginning of a new.</p>
Jack Gray	The results of the limited modernization movement in China were not entirely insignificant. The reason why this partial success came to look like a total failure was the extraordinary rise of Japan.

How do we build a consensus out of these varying arguments regarding SSM?