#### Lesson 12

## Question for the Lesson/What you need to know in this lesson:

What are the causes for the 1911 revolution?

Who is responsible for the revolution? Was Sun Yat-sen and the revolutionaries responsible for the overthrow of the Manchu dynasty in 1911?

Was 1911 Revolution really a revolution?

Was 1911 a successful revolution?

#### **IB Questions**

Causes of 1911 Revolution

#### Role of Sun Yat-Sen for the 1911 Revolution

- 1. To what extent was Sun Yixian (Sun Yat-Sen) responsible for bringing about the revolution of 1911 in China? (N08, Q8)
- 2. To what extent was the 1911 Double Ten Nationalist Revolution due to the revolutionary activities of Sun Yat-Sen? (M11, Q7)
- 3. Evaluate the importance of Sun Yixian (Sun Yat-sen) to the Nationalist Revolution in China in 1911. (N13)

### Role of Sun Yat-Sen for the emergence of Modern China

4. "The role of Sun Yatsen (Sun Yat-sen) in the emergence of modern China has been greatly exaggerated." To what extent do you agree with this statement? (M09, Q12)

## 1. Background to 1911 Revolution

After the Japanese war, two major political movements developed, each representing a different approach to achieve national salvation in the face of accelerating foreign imperialism and dynastic decline.

One was the progressive reform of 1898, led by Kang Yu-wei from which evolved the Late Qing reform and constitutional movements of the 1900s. The other was a revolutionary movement led by western-trained Dr Sun Yat-sen, who advocated the complete overthrow of the Manchu dynasty. At first the progressive reformers played the more prominent role but as the Qing endeavours proved insincere and discriminatory against the Chinese, the revolutionaries gained increasing support from the younger intellectuals, the secret societies and the overseas Chinese

communities. Finally in 1911 the age-old imperial institution was swept out of existence and was replaced with a republic.

But the question is, to what extent was it the act of revolutionaries the cause for the fall of the Qing dynasty?

- 2. What is a Revolution?
- 3. Reasons for the rise of revolutionary movements/Context for Revolution

## i) Qing Decadence

Ever since the mid-19<sup>th</sup> century, China was suffering from national humiliation. The long list of unequal treaties from the Treaty of Nanking in 1842, the Boxer Protocol of 1901, the loss of tributary states in the 1880s and the 1890s and the lack of vigour in domestic administration testify to the utter Qing inability to defend China's honour in the modern world. What had been a proud Middle-Kingdom was seen to have been reduced to a semi-colonial status. The death knell was sounded when the court instituted an anti-Chinese policy under the pretext of reform and constitutionalism. Such a flagrant show of discrimination amidst rapid dynastic decline exacerbated opposition from the ruled. (refer to lesson 7)

## ii) Tradition of Nationalistic Revolution

Anti-Manchu sentiment never disappeared throughout the 268 year dynasty. The various Ming loyalist movements, kept alive in underground organizations and secret societies and the activities of the Heaven and Earth society, the White Lotus Rebellion and the Taiping Rebellion, demonstrated the unending thread of nationalistic-racial protest. Dr Sun's revolution was very much in this tradition – anti-Manchu.

## iii) Foreign Influence

The great revolutions of the modern West-the Glorious Revolution in England, the American Revolution and the French Revolution all exerted a profound influence upon the Chinese. The ideas of democracy, independence, human rights, equality and freedom swept through the minds of young Chinese. The successful national unification of Italy and Germany in 1870 served as great examples for forward-looking Chinese, prompting them to take similar action. Nationalism, democracy and republicanism now became the motivating forces for revolutionary change in China.

### iv) Effect of Late Qing Reforms - Inflamed the feeling of constitutionalism

The most striking feature of this new reform movement, however, was the immense voluntary, non-government effort which was touched off by the commitment of the central government to change. The Court could not stem the floods which it had released. For examples, while the new official schools were established only slowly, private foundations multiplied apace and with a modern curriculum proved far more popular than those of the Government. Control of education, the first principle of Confucian government, was thus lost.

A new generation sceptical of the old values, trained in Western ideas, impatient for results and indifferent, if not hostile to the Manchu court, began to appear.

In the area of projected political reform symbolized by Youwei had advocated in 1898, organized pressure groups and voluntary associations multiplied; Chinese popular opinion became a reality and the press discussed issues of constitutionalism which the Manchu government was most reluctant to raise. The 9 year tutelage period was implemented before a parliament was created.

In 1909, the Regent created elected provincial assemblies. He had no intention of promoting decentralization. On the contrary, he hoped that these merely consultative assemblies, by acting as sounding boards, would increase the effectiveness of central government. The result was dramatically different. Decentralization of authority had already gone too far, while the new economic interests that were developing rapidly were provincial rather than national, in their markets, their organizations and their relations to government. For a gentry no longer linked to the centre by the examination system, which had been finally abolished, the effective source of the benefits which political action could gain was no longer the national but the provincial capital. It was also unwise to create provincial assemblies while postponing the establishment of a national parliament. In the absence of an elected assembly at the national level the provincial assemblies gained all the moral authority of their position as elected bodies. Unable to operate at a national level, China's new political leaders acted with all the more vigour at the level of the province, and so far from being content with a consultative role they immediately set about the task of governing their provinces in virtual autonomy. In addition, delegates from the assemblies came together one petition after another demanding the immediate establishment of a national parliament. Their efforts won only a reduction of the period of tutelage from 9 to 6 years, which satisfied no one.

### v) Effect of Late Qing Reforms - Anti-Chinese Discrimination

The Cabinet which was formed with seven Manchus, one Mongolian and only four Chinese, inflamed the feeling of the constitutionalists. The domination of the new cabinet by Manchus and their Mongol allies seriously damaged the already weakening links between the Chinese and their foreign rulers. The Manchu nobles sending their sons for military training in Germany and holding command of the armies of the capital and the metropolitan province, monopolizing the 12 new ministries and now the new cabinet, had broken all the rules of the balance of appointments between Chinese and Manchus.

At the same time the Court sought to weaken the provincial Governors-General, the greatest of whom were Chinese. In this they were aided by the death of Li Hung chang and Liu K'un-i. The two most powerful political figures remaining Chang Chitung and Yuan Shi-kai were kicked upstairs as Presidents of the Grand Council and so deprived of their provincial power.

When the revolution of 1911 happened, the Manchus could no longer depend on any loyalty of the ruling class as power throughout China was in the hands of the provincial assemblies. They were disappointed by the delay of constitutional changes. They were disgusted by the manipulation of recent changes in favour of the Manchu nobles. When the news of the Wuhan uprising spread, one by one the provinces of China declared their independence. In almost every case this was decided by an alliance of provincial assembly men and low-ranking soldiers.

## vi) Revolutionary Movement

The constitutional movement was quite separate from the revolutionary movement. The revolutionary movement was first confined to far south. The inhabitants of Kwangtung and Guangxi had never been wholly reconciled to Manchu rule. In Southeast Asia, on the west-coast of America and Canada, and elsewhere there were Chinese populations who, being most entirely southern in origin, had carried with them their southern hostility to the Manchus, while their experience of life under Western rule had left them prepared for more radical solutions to China's problems and they still identified themselves with their brethren at home and with the fate of China. It is not surprising therefore that the revolutionary nationalist movement was founded among overseas Chinese. For instance, Sun Yat-sen, its founder, had turned to revolution when his first political attempt to persuade Li Hung-chang to support moderate reforms was refused a hearing. He also made headway in persuading the overseas Chinese to support him when the hope of peaceful changes began to fade.

Meanwhile, other groups of revolutionaries were being formed among Chinese students in Japan. Most of them were from the Yangzi provinces. They were mainly from higher social classes than Sun, they had received a formal Chinese education and they were exposed in Japan to more radical ideas than were generally influential among the Chinese communities abroad. On their return to China they began, often under cover of working as teachers to organize revolution.

### vii) Need for Political Innovation

The monarchical institution of China, in the view of Dr Sun, was responsible for the succession of imperial dynasties in the past 2000 years without ever changing the substance of government. Chinese history revolved around the cycle of division, disorder, unification and disorder, noted Sun, and each period of disorder was followed by lengthy and merciless struggle for the throne by many contenders until one ultimately won out. In the process the country and the people suffered and the historical pattern repeated itself periodically. To break this cycle and to give a proper outlet to the ambitions of men, it was necessary to replace the monarchy with a republic – in which all could fulfil their dreams, exercise their rights and become leaders of the provinces and the nations. To achieve this goal, Sun urged all freedom-loving people to participate in a National Revolution to bring about the downfall of the imperial system and the Manchu dynasty, and to introduce a modern republic, free from foreign intervention and interference.

## 4. To what extent Sun Yat-sen was responsible for the 1911 Revolution?

## i) Sun Yat-sen: Background Information

Sun Yat0sen is known as the father of the Chinese Revolution. Born in Hsian-shan near Canton into a peasant family, he was educated in Hawaii as well as Hong Kong. He witnessed wonders of ships, had been exposed to American's influences in the form of ideas of democracy, modern legal system, modern schools and the need for industrial development and while he studied at the College of Medicine for Chinese in Hong Kong he witnessed the efficiency of British colonial administration, modern hygienic developments and the orderliness. For all its 4000 years of civilization, China had no cities as well groomed as Hong Kong which had been under the British rule for only a few decades. At the same time, he also witnessed China's defeat by France in 1885 and due to all these he began to develop idea about overthrowing the Manchu dynasty.

Before 1894, while planning for the overthrow of the Manchu dynasty, he also considered reform as a possible means of saving China. He suggested to Li Hungchang that wealth and power of European states were not achieved by battleships and cannon but by the full development of human talents, the full exploitation of the earth's resources, and free exchanges of goods. China thus must develop its talents through universal free education, vocational guidance, and promotion of science and agriculture. But Sun Yat-sen, eventually turned to revolution when his first political attempt to persuade Li Hung-chang to support moderate reforms was refused a hearing.

## ii) Formation of Revolutionary Organizations and Uprising

Turning to revolution, he seek aid from the Chinese overseas, the secret societies, the Christian converts and the missionaries – men existing on the fringes of Chinese society. In 1894 he formed the Revive China Society in Honolulu and its headquarter in Hong Kong in 1895. Members of the society took an oath to "expel the Manchus, restore the Chinese rule and establish a federal republic."

An uprising to capture Canton was planned for in Oct 1895, which however was discovered and Sun fled to Hong Kong only to find that the British authorities had complied with a Qing request to ban him for 5 years and so he escaped to Japan. In 1896, when he was in London, Sun was lured to the Chinese legation, where he was kidnapped and detained. Later he was released due to the interference However, when this illegal kidnap was exposed, Sun became famous overnight; an unexpected result of the kidnap.

Taking advantage of the Boxer Rebellion in 1900, Sun dispatched Cheng Shih-liang to organize an **uprising at Waichow, north of Hong Kong. Again the plot was discovered and this time Sun fled to Formosa**. However, the mismanagement of the Qing court during the Boxer catastrophe led many to look upon Sun in favour. No longer was he seen as a rebel but rather a patriotic, devoted revolutionary working for the betterment of his country and people. Students at home and in Japan enthusiastically supported him.

Encouraged by the enthusiastic response of the Chinese students in Japan, he developed the idea of forming a revolutionary party. Sun stressed the need for unifying all revolutionary groups, such as the China Revival Society and the Restoration Society, into one organization to avoid duplication of efforts and a struggle for power among themselves. Hence, The Chinese United League (Tongmenghui) was formed in August 1905 and Sun was the elected Chairman. The members took an oath to pledge their support to expel the Manchus, restore the Chinese rule, establish a republic and equalize the land. A new revolutionary party was therefore formed. Sun's Three People's Principles were accepted as the revolutionary principle of the Tongmenhui, although the majority of the members focused only on the first two principles of nationalism and democracy.

The membership of Tongmenhui grew rapidly to 963 by 1906, of whom 863 joined in Japan and the rest coming from Europe, Hawaii, Hong Kong and Malaya. Branches were established in China as well as in key overseas communities.

**Hsu:** The founding of the Tongmenghui was a milestone in the Chinese revolution as it changed the character and style of the revolution. No longer did Sun operate on the periphery of society, he had moved into the main stream of Chinese nationalism, receiving new support from the returned students, dissatisfied literati, and progressive army officers – groups that traditionally provided the leadership in China.

The social bases and potential areas of operations had substantially enlarged. The Tongmenhui was multi-provincial and multiclass, capable of instigating uprisings along the coast as well as in the interior of China. Above all it provided a unified central organization that resembled a modern political party, which served as a rallying point for all revolutionaries and progressive forces in the country.

The pulse of the revolution now quickened. Between 1906 and 1911 there were 6 uprisings in Kwangtung and once each in Kwangsi and Yunnan, making a total of 10, including the first two attempts at Canton and Waichow. The last revolutionary attempt in April 1911, aiming at capturing the important provincial capital of Canton, created such a sensation and shock to the Qing court that it presaged the success of the next attempt at Wuchang half a year later.

**Revisionists**: Have stressed that Sun's organisations were very mess as he lacked organizational and administrative ability and hence his control over the members were very loose. Security was very poor which led to the exposure of their plots and pointed out that the Tongmenghui fell apart very quickly after 1905 and its HQ in Tokyo had little contact with Sun. The reality was that the 1911 revolution was carried out by small cells.

# iii) Sun's Three People's Principles and detailed procedure for the revolution

The Three People's Principles became the revolutionary philosophy. The first principle, **nationalism**, called for not only the overthrow of the alien Manchu but also the removal of foreign imperialistic yoke. Sun considered the Chinese 'a sheet of loose sand' as they were unaware of their nationhood and had little loyalty to the

nation-state. His idea originally pitted the Han Chinese against the Manchus as his main message was the anti-Manchu nationalism which would help bind the gentry, revolutionaries and secret societies. In addition, after 1911 revolution, he focused on eliminating the unequal treaties.

The second principle, **democracy**, aimed at achieving the Four Rights of the people – initiative, referendum, election, and recall – and the Five Rights for the government: executive, legislative, judicial, control and examination. However, he also stressed the need for a strong state over individual liberty.

The third principle, **People's Livelihood**, stressed the need for regulating capital and equalizing land (land to the tiller). However, he rejected socialism or Marxism and did not reject capitalism. He did not support land appropriation but favoured land being returned to cultivators. He favoured capitalist development ad was willing to accept foreign investment but wanted government controls. He adopted protectionism and resisted foreign influx of goods.

In addition, **Sun worked out a detailed procedure for his revolution**. **Initially,** there would be a **military rule of 3 years** in the areas liberated by the revolutionary force. During this period, the military government would control all military as well as civil affairs at the district level. Meanwhile it will cooperate with the local people towards eliminating the old political and social evils such as slavery, foot-binding, opium-smoking and bureaucratic corruption.

The **second stage** would be a **period of political tutelage**, lasting no more than 6 years, during which time local self-government would be instituted and popular elections for local assemblies and administrators would be held. However, the military government would still retain control of the central government. During this period, there would be a provisional constitution to specify the rights and duties of the military government and the people.

When the period of tutelage ended, the military government would be dissolved and the country would be governed by a new constitution.

In sum, Sun envisioned a **3 stage revolution** to lead the country into constitutionalism.

### iv) The Revolution

The ten unsuccessful attempts at revolution all took place in the south and southwest, where proximity to Hong Kong and Hanoi offered greater freedom of plotting and organization. But powerful elements within the Tongmenghui wanted to move to the heart of Central China or Peking to hurt the dynasty the most. If the tricities of Wuhan could be captured, they reasoned, the revolutionaries would be in good position to respond to action in the south or advance north to the capital. The central provinces of Hupeh and Hunan emerged as the prime target.

In Hupeh there existed already two organizations. One was called Common Advancement Society founded in 1907, which consisted largely of returned students from Japan and secret society members. The other was an offspring of the Military Study Society, which came into being in Jan 1911 and consisted generally of

members of the Qing New Army in Hupeh who had been won over to the revolutionary cause. In June 1911, these two societies agreed to cooperate in a joint action at Wuchang and invitations were extended to Huang Hsing (member of the Tongmenghui) and Sung Chia-jen (Sun's friend and had wide connections with secret societies) in Shanghai to come to direct the revolution. Sun Yat-sen was abroad.

The occasion that touched off this joint action in was a railway controversy. The gentry and people of 4 provinces, Kwangtung, Hunan, Hupeh and Szechwan protested the Qing's nationalization as well as the invasion of foreign capital in the railway construction. The provisional assembly of Szechwan, representing the interest of the gentry, the rich landlords and the wealthy merchants took the lead in protesting this unfair treatment and attacking Peking for betraying their interests to the foreigners. As fights between government troops and the demonstrators intensified, to control the unrest in Szechwan, the court transferred part of the Hupeh New Army there – which placed the strategic city of Wuchang in a vulnerable position, which the revolutionaries were able to take advantage of.

When a bomb accidentally exploded in the revolutionary headquarters located in the Russian Concession of Hankow, subsequent police raids resulted in the arrest of 32 revolutionaries and the seizure of weapons, explosives and important documents including lists of names of the members of the New Army who had been won over. To protect themselves, some battalions of the New Army decided to strike. They seized the government munition depot in Wuchang on 10 Oct and attacked the office of the governor-general, who fled along with the military commander.

Having no revolutionary leaders present, Sun being abroad and Huang still in Shanghai, they drafted the reluctant Qing brigade commander, Li Yuanhong, who had shown sympathy with the revolution, was appointed as the civilian executive chief of the revolutionary government. It was he who had sent out telegrams to the other provinces urging them to declare independence of the Qing court. On Oct 12, Hanyang and Hankow quickly fell to the revolutionaries.

It was very possible that had the Manchu-governor general had stayed, the military commander would have stayed and probably would have crushed the thin revolutionary forces, estimated at a little more than 2000 men.

Indeed what was most encouraging was the rapid succession of declaration of independence by the provinces and important municipalities such as Yunnan, Shanghai, Fukien and Kwantung and later Shanghai and Nanking. By the end of October, seven provinces established revolutionary governments and seceded from the Qing empire. In another month, 7 more had seceded. Within a month and half, 15 provinces or two-thirds of all China seceded from the Qing dynasty.

In January 1912, Sun Yat-sen had returned to China to be proclaimed provisional president of the Republic of China by a rump parliament meeting in Nanjing.

## The Manchu abdication and Role of Yuan Shikai

In a dying struggle for survival, the court appointed Yuan Shih-kai, governor-general of Hupeh and Hunan. However, Yuan Shih-kai demanded for inauguration of a national assembly in a year, organization of a responsible cabinet, pardon for the revolutionaries, lifting the ban on parties, full power to control the army and the navy and guarantee of sufficient military funds to quell the revolutionaries at Wuchang. Yuan had intention to make himself the most powerful in the country. Under the pressure of the military defeat and the rapid secession of the provinces, the regent gave in to Yuan's demands and Yuan was appointed the imperial commissioner in full charge of the army and the navy.

However, when two leaders of the Qing 20<sup>th</sup> Division stationed at Laun-chou demanded of the court the inauguration of a constitutional monarchy within a year, the court, stunned by the secession of another province Shansi on the same day, meekly bowed to the demand. Yuan was made the premier and went south to take charge of the campaign against the revolutionaries.

Huang Hsing made contacts with Yuan to promise him the future presidency of the republic if he would support the republic and force the abdication of the Qing emperor. Yuan himself felt that the days of the dynasty was numbered. Yuan instigated 50 of his generals to announce their support of the republic and impressed upon the court that it was better to abdicate gracefully than to lose everything, the Qing abdicated as the government troops have lost the will to fight.

On Feb 12, 1911, Yuan pledged his support of the Republic, which was a prerequisite to his assumption of the presidency. On Feb 13, Sun resigned as the provisional president of the Republic and recommended that Yuan be named his successor contingent upon his acceptance of 3 conditions, namely, that Nanking remain the capital, that Yuan came to Nanking to assume the provisional presidency and that he observe the provisional constitution to be drafted by the provisional parliament.

On March 11, Sun promulgated the Provisional Constitution and on Apirl 1, 1912, Sun relinquished his duties and on April 5 Peking was made the national capital.

### v) 1911 Historiography

The Revolution of 1911 remains curiously difficult to categorize. Three distinct schools of interpretation contended with each other over the century: that 1911 represented

- (i) the revolutionaries' revolution
- (ii) the rising bourgeoisie's revolution
- (iii) the urban gentry's revolution

The government of Taiwan traces its origin to Sun Yat-sen and the Three People Principles. This school of thought emphasizing the revolutionary heroism of a few leaders in effect proposes that China advanced through the efforts of specifically farsighted and capable leaders.

On the other hand, the People Republic of China (PRC) dates its creation to the Communist Revolution but also takes the 1911 Revolution as a pivotal moment in its pre-history. The PRC's official historiography treats 1911 as the beginning of the bourgeoisie phase of a longer revolutionary — anti-feudal and anti-imperialist — struggle. This second school of thought suggests that a modern revolution would move inevitably through a bourgeoisie phase leading finally to the victory of the proletariat.

Western historians look to long-term explanations that examine the key role played by relatively conservative social forces in the overthrow of the Qing. This third school sees 1911 less as the product of deliberate, creative action and more the result of the decay and final collapse of an old, malfunctioning system.

But there are overlaps.

The Qing had very little trouble suppressing most of the uprisings Sun and other revolutionaries instigated. The uprisings from the 1890s on suffered from faulty intelligence, poor logistics, and minimal local support in most cases, and seldom lasted more than a couple of days. The revolutions lacked capable leaders, although this was not to say that there was no revolutionary potential.

The soldiers who started the Wuchang uprising had only the most tenuous links with National Alliance (Tongmenhui), although they were certainly disaffected from the Qing. The Tongmenghui did specifically target the 'New Armies' of the modernizing Qing military for propaganda and organizational efforts. One of the Qing's late 19<sup>th</sup> century reforms, the New Armies were meant to replace the dynasty's hidebound Manchu and lower-class Chinese armies with a better-trained, literate and effective fighting force. Yuan Shikai was one of their chief organizers. The Wing tried to centralize the New Armies and reassert Manchu control but with partial success. But the Tongmenghui too only had partial success in appealing to the better-educated, more nationalistic troops.

In the final anasysis, the Qing fell because its own army commanders were unwilling to support it and because the Chinese elites – gentry and wealthy merchants – saw no reason to prefer the Qing over the revolutionaries, and not because of the military prowess of the revolutionaries. The true face of the 1911 revolution belonged to Yuan Shikai and not Sun yat-sen.

The third school of thought, dominated by western social historians, including Joseph Esherick, argues that "exiled revolutionary conspirators may capitalize on revolutionary situations, but they do not fundamentally cause revolutions."

They argue that in the case of the China, the conservatives as well as the radical tendencies among the new professionals, students, businessmen, and above all, local leaders including local gentry families.

In addition, they also point to the long-term devolution of central power to the provinces and counties. The revolution thus appears not to be a step toward making China stronger so much as part of an ongoing collapse. The revolution resulted in

the further militarization of Chinese society, culminating in the warlord era between 1916 and 1927.

In this view, local elites in China, especially from the wealthier provinces, determined the outcome of the revolution. The Qing empire survived the great mid-19<sup>th</sup> century rebellions – civil wars that left 20 to 30 million persons dead – the government was never able to fully reassert central control. Local leaders performed a number of state functionaries and a new kind of alliance between successful gentry and merchants began to dominate in some provinces. Hence, an exclusive focus on either a bourgeois or a gentry class is misleading.

Late Qing elites, were however, not revolutionaries. They pressed the dynasty with demands for limited local autonomy, for more rapid progress towards a constitutional monarchy and for resistance against imperialism. Politically, after Qing turned to reforms in the wake of the Boxer Rebellion, those very reforms created forces demanding further change. Elections for provisional assemblies in 1908, for example, only increased demands for a constitution. From a mixture of motives, urban-based gentry demanded a degree of local autonomy within a constitutional framework. If the Qing were unwilling or unable to provide this, the dynasty's natural constituency could turn against it.

In addition, without detracting from the accomplishments of revolutionaries, of reform elites and of conservative gentry, it also had to be noted that the Qing dynastic system was also breaking down on its own. One sort of pressure came from foreign imperialism.

vi) To what extent was 1911 revolution a revolution? (refer to Lesson 13 as well for a more complete answer to this question)

Yes	No
The rise of the republic was an epochal event in Chinese history for it brought an end to more than 2000 years of imperial dynasties.	Yet the revolution was an incomplete one with many unfortunate repercussions. Most of Sun's followers focused on overthrowing the Manchu regime and the establishment of a republic. Few paid attention to the more important task of democratic reconstruction and the problem of people's livelihood. They were willing to compromise with so unprincipled a man as Yuan to establish the republic.
It fulfilled the dreams of the two-and-a- half-century nationalistic revolutionary tradition, but went beyond narrow racial considerations to liberate political power from one-ethnic group, the Manchus, and extend it to all the people of China - Hsu	Sun Yat-sen's 3 stage revolution was ignored. The readiness of the revolutionaries to cooperate with the old elements paved the way for warlordism and attempts to revive the imperial system.

### Peter Zarrow:

It did not result in a future that was very different from the past. The new "Republic of China" was not republican; many of the old Qing bureaucrats simply stayed in their jobs. Nor did culture, society, and the economy appear to change, even with the collapse of the imperial political structure. They were changing but not as direct results of the revolution.

### Peter Zarrow:

Yet even if the revolution failed to produce a new, effective political system, its effects were profound. The gentry class could not survive the loss of their special relationship with the emperor that the civil service examinations had ratified. The exams had been abolished in 1905 and the last chance of basing some kind of new relationship on the old was destroyed in 1911. Without some link to the imperial centre, rural elites lost their legitimacy. Even if the 1911 Revolution cannot be isolated as the prime cause of all these changes, it did stimulate further change. Revolution itself became a common way of thinking about change.